

Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/23525134)

# Aquaculture Reports



journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/aqrep](https://www.elsevier.com/locate/aqrep)

# Fermented aquatic weed meal (FAWM) as a protein source in Asian Catfish *Clarias batrachus* diets: Impacts on growth, blood chemistry profile, liver and gut morphology and economic efficiency

Talukdar Jannat Tamanna Shimul <sup>a</sup>, Parashuram Kallem <sup>b</sup>, Shishir Kumar Nandi <sup>a</sup>, Sadia Afrin <sup>a</sup>, Afrina Yeasmin Suma <sup>a</sup>, Zulhisyam Abdul Kari <sup>c,d,\*</sup>, Suniza Anis Mohamad Sukri <sup>c,d</sup>, Martina Irwan Khoo <sup>e</sup>, Nurdiyana Aqilah Roslan <sup>f</sup>, Ajay Guru <sup>g</sup>, Krishnakumar Velayudhannair <sup>h</sup>, El-Sayed Hemdan Eissa<sup>i</sup>, Md. Shahab Uddin<sup>a</sup>, Muhammad Anamul Kabir<sup>a,c,\*\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> *Department of Aquaculture, Faculty of Fisheries, Sylhet Agricultural University, Sylhet 3100, Bangladesh*

<sup>b</sup> Department of Environmental and Public Health, College of Health Sciences, Abu Dhabi University, P.O. Box 59911, Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates

<sup>c</sup> Department of Agricultural Sciences, Faculty of Agro-Based Industry, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Jeli Campus, Jeli 17600, Malaysia

<sup>d</sup> Advanced Livestock and Aquaculture Research Group, Faculty of Agro-Based Industry, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Jeli Campus, Jeli 17600, Malaysia

e Department of Chemical Pathology, School of Medical Sciences, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Kubang Kerian, Kota Bharu 16150, Malaysia

<sup>f</sup> Department of Agricultural and Food Science, Universiti Tunku Abdul Rahman, Kampar Campus, Jalan Universiti, Bandar Barat, Kampar, Perak 31900, Malaysia

<sup>8</sup> Department of Cariology, Saveetha Dental College and Hospitals, Saveetha Institute of Medical and Technical Sciences, Saveetha University, Chennai, Tamil Nadu

*600077, India*

h Department of Life Sciences, CHRIST (Deemed to be University), Bangalore Central Campus, Dharmaram Post, Hosur Road, Bengaluru, Karnataka 560029, India <sup>i</sup> *Fish Research Centre, Faculty of Environmental Agricultural Sciences, Arish University, El-Arish, Egypt*

# ARTICLE INFO

*Keywords:* Fermented aquatic weed meal Protein source Asian catfish Growth performance Health status Sustainable aquaculture

# ABSTRACT

The global aquaculture industry is increasingly seeking sustainable alternatives to fishmeal (FM) due to its high price and shortfall in supply. In this context, fermented aquatic weed meal (FAWM) could emerge as a viable plant protein source for aquafeed. Four isoproteic diets [30 % crude protein (CP)] were formulated, incorporating 50 % total protein from FAWM comprising fermented *Azolla* diet (D<sub>1</sub>), *Pistia* diet (D<sub>2</sub>), and *Eichhornia* diet  $(D_3)$ . The control diet  $(D_0)$  did not contain FAWM. At the end of the 90 days feeding trial, their growth performance, whole-body proximate composition, gut microbial load, haemato-biochemical indices, liver and gut health, and economic efficiency were determined. Fish fed with  $D_0$  had significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) improved growth performance and feed utilization compared to other treatment groups. Meanwhile, the fish supplemented with  $D_1$ diet exhibited significantly (p *<* 0.05) higher final weight (g), specific growth rate (%/day), weight gain (%), total biomass (g), and protein efficiency ratio among the FAWM dietary groups. The  $D_1$  group also demonstrated the significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) highest whole-body CP (64.27  $\pm$  0.40 %) and lower crude lipid (8.24  $\pm$  0.28 %) compared to other test diets. The total bacteria (TB) and lactic acid bacteria (LAB) in the fish gut were found to be significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) higher in  $D_1$  group. Furthermore, most of the hemato-biochemical indices of fish were significantly (p *<* 0.05) affected by FAWM inclusions, with few exceptions. The histological findings indicated that amongst the FAWM groups,  $D_1$  fish exhibited improved intestinal health. Nonetheless, the gut of the control fish demonstrated substantially ( $p < 0.05$ ) lower villi width and crypt depth than other treatments. The  $D_1$  and D2 diet groups had significantly improved liver health. Moreover, FAWM inclusion enhanced economic efficiency by considerably reducing farm feed cost (US\$/kg) and increasing return on investment (%). In summary, dietary inclusion of fermented *Azolla pinnata* (D<sub>1</sub>) protein at 50 % in aquafeed promoted feed utilization, growth, health, and farm economics of Asian catfish fingerlings compared to other FAWM diets.

\*\* Corresponding author at: Department of Aquaculture, Faculty of Fisheries, Sylhet Agricultural University, Sylhet 3100, Bangladesh.

*E-mail addresses:* [zulhisyam.a@umk.edu.my](mailto:zulhisyam.a@umk.edu.my) (Z.A. Kari), [anamul.aq@sau.ac.bd](mailto:anamul.aq@sau.ac.bd) (M.A. Kabir).

# <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2024.102305>

Available online 16 August 2024 Received 22 December 2023; Received in revised form 3 August 2024; Accepted 9 August 2024

2352-5134/© 2024 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/\)](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author at: Department of Agricultural Sciences, Faculty of Agro-Based Industry, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Jeli Campus, Jeli 17600, Malaysia.

## **1. Introduction**

Aquaculture is a rapidly expanding industry in global food production, pivotal in fulfilling the rising demand for aquatic protein sources and mitigating the pressure on dwindling wild fish stocks [\(FAO,](#page-9-0) 2020). Asian catfish is a prominent candidate in the aquaculture sector due to its robust growth, wide adaptability, and high market acceptance. Moreover, this species is commercially valuable because of its high-profile nutrients ([Thorat,](#page-10-0) 2017). Nevertheless, achieving sustainable growth and profitability in Asian catfish farming requires careful consideration in dietary formulation, particularly in selecting protein sources [\(Chandra](#page-8-0) Segaran et al., 2023). Protein is an essential macronutrient in the fish diet, accounting for a significant portion of the farm production costs [\(Kabir](#page-9-0) et al., 2019). As the aquaculture industry strives towards environmental and economic sustainability, the search for alternative, cost-effective, and eco-friendly protein sources from plant-based ingredients, such as aquatic weeds, assumes critical significance [\(Dawood](#page-8-0) and Kari, 2024; Kari et al., 2023).

Aquatic weeds are often considered a nuisance in aquatic ecosystems, but have recently gained interest from aquaculturists as promising and sustainable fish feed ingredients due to their nutritional profile, availability ([Muhammad](#page-9-0) Anamul et al., 2023), and digestibility ([Akan](#page-8-0)kali and [Elenwo,](#page-8-0) 2019). [Dorothy](#page-9-0) et al. (2018) reported that aquatic weed meal (AWM) offers significant nutritional value [Crude protein (CP): 26.5–32.5 %] and is rich in amino acids, minerals, and vitamins making it a viable protein source for aquafeed formulation ([Dorothy](#page-9-0) et al., 2018; [Muhammad](#page-9-0) Anamul et al., 2023). Moreover, incorporating aquatic weeds into fish feed provides a multifaceted approach to environmental waste management, sustainability, and cost reduction in aquaculture ([Tewari](#page-10-0) and Kaur, 2022). Nonetheless, the presence of antinutritional factors (ANFs), high crude fiber, and other harmful compounds in aquatic weeds adversely impacts the growth and health of aquatic organisms and limits their application in aquaculture feed development [\(Council,](#page-8-0) 2011; Elesho et al., 2021; Francis et al., 2001; Sadia et al., [2023;](#page-8-0) Vo et al., 2020). Therefore, researchers have proposed the semi-solidify fermentation (SSF) technology to reduce the ANFs and crude fiber levels in AWM to be used as an aquafeed ingredient [\(De](#page-8-0) [Oliveira](#page-8-0) et al., 2022; Hossain et al., 2023; Jiang et al., 2023; Zakaria et al., 2022; [Zulhisyam](#page-8-0) et al., 2020). SSF is a microbial process wherein microorganisms grow on a semi-solid substrate like molasses under controlled conditions in order to ferment organic materials. The process involves maintaining a semi-solid consistency of the fermented products, typically achieved by controlling moisture, pH, temperature [\(Sri](#page-10-0)[vastava](#page-10-0) et al., 2019) and the addition of specific microbial inoculant ([Dawood](#page-8-0) and Koshio, 2020). The mechanism of SSF involves the action of microorganisms, such as bacteria, yeast, and fungi, which generate enzymes capable of breaking down complex polysaccharides and protein into simpler and more digestible forms ([Colla](#page-8-0) et al., 2023). Furthermore, this approach is pivotal in bolstering the bioavailability of nutrients and increasing the palatability and digestibility of feedstuff ingredients [\(Dawood](#page-8-0) and Koshio, 2020).

Recent reports have demonstrated the successful incorporation of FAWM in the diets of various commercial important fish species. For instance, Common carp *Cyprinus carpio* treated with *Chaetomium globosum* fermented *Eicchornia crassipes* leaf meal as high as 15 g/kg exhibited beneficial effects on growth and health status ([Malik](#page-9-0) et al., 2024). [Baruah](#page-8-0) et al. (2018) reported that *Ipomoea aquatica* leaf meal fermented with *Aspergillus oryzae* at approximately 30–40 % in diets significantly bolstered the growth performance and feed utilization of Indian major carp *Labeo rohita*. Furthermore, different levels of fermented aquatic macrophytes had notable impacts on growth, survival, nutrient digestibility, whole-body biochemical composition, and immunity in Nile tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus* [\(Velasquez](#page-10-0) ´ et al., 2015), Rohu *Labeo rohita* ([Mandal](#page-9-0) and Ghosh, 2019), and African catfish *Clarias gariepinus* [\(Irabor](#page-9-0) et al., [2022](#page-9-0)). Nonetheless, there are limited studies on the relationship between dietary FAWM and the growth performance and health status of

*C. batrachus* in the aquaculture industry. Therefore, this study aimed to evaluate the effects of different dietary FAWM at 50 % total protein inclusion levels on the growth and health status of Asian catfish production in captivity.

# **2. Materials and methods**

#### *2.1. Preparation of fermented aquatic weeds meal (FAWM)*

Raw mosquito fern (*Azolla pinnata*), water lettuce (*Pistia stratiotes*), and water hyacinth (*Eichhornia crassipes*) were collected from the haor basin of Habiganj, Sylhet, Bangladesh. The samples were sorted and exposed to sun-drying to reduce their moisture level to *<*10 %. Subsequently, they were processed into a fine powder and subjected to semisolidify fermentation following the protocol established by [Zulhisyam](#page-10-0) et al. [\(2020\)](#page-10-0) and Nandi et al. [\(2023\),](#page-10-0) with slight modifications. First, the aquatic weed meal fine powders were placed into separate airtight plastic containers and mixed with 0.001 % *Lactobacillus acidophilus* (Sigma, St. Louis, MO, USA) and 10 % molasses separately before adding other ingredients to the mixture and stored in an airtight plastic container for 21 days to facilitate the fermentation process.

# *2.2. Experimental diet formulation*

The experimental diet ingredients and chemical composition are detailed in Table 1. Four experimental diets (30 % CP) were formulated to include 50 % total protein from FAWM: fermented *A. pinnata*  $(D_1)$ , *Pistia stratiotes* ( $D_2$ ), and *Eichhornia crassipes* ( $D_3$ ), and control diet with 0 % FAWM ( $D_0$ ). The proximate composition of each FAWM was estimated prior to diet preparation ([Table](#page-2-0) 2). All the ingredients were finely ground, homogenized, and then formed into pellets using an extruder (Model: LM40-floating feed machine, Henan Lima Machinery Manufacture Co. Limited, China), with the feed measuring 2 mm in size. The formulated pellets were oven-dried overnight at 50 ◦C and stored at − 20

#### **Table 1**

Feed formulation and proximate composition (dry matter basis) of the experimental diets.

Ingredient (%)	Diet (% FAWM)			
	$D_0$	$D_1$	D <sub>2</sub>	$D_3$
Danish fish meala	38	15	16	17
Fermented Azolla pinnata	$\Omega$	43	$\Omega$	0
<b>Fermented Pistia stratiotes</b>	$\Omega$	$\Omega$	45	$\Omega$
Fermented Eichhornia crassipes	$\Omega$	$\Omega$	$\Omega$	47
Soybean meal	12	10	10	10
Flonr	20	16	13	10
Corn starch	19	5	5	5
Soybean oil	3	3	3	3
Palm oil	2	$\overline{2}$	2	$\overline{2}$
Vitamin and mineral premixb	3	3	3	3
CMC <sub>c</sub>	3	3	3	3
Total	100	100	100	100
Feed raw materials cost (US\$/MT)	1068.20	708.59	716.70	724.80
Proximate composition (%)				
Moisture	9.45	9.60	9.41	9.91
Crude protein	30.55	30.49	30.28	30.01
Crude lipid	7.45	7.29	7.30	7.12
Crude fibre	8.01	8.12	8.31	8.95
Crude ash	9.33	9.34	9.24	9.30
<b>NFEd</b>	35.21	35.16	35.46	34.71

Notes:

<sup>a</sup> Danish fish meal: Crude protein, 62 %; crude lipid, 8.61 %; crude ash, 17.95 %; moisture, 11.08 %.

<sup>b</sup> Vitamin and mineral premix (g/kg premix): Vitamins A, D, E, K, C, B<sub>1</sub>, B<sub>2</sub>, B<sub>6</sub>, B<sub>12</sub>, KCl, 90; KI, 0.04; CaHPO<sub>4</sub>.2H<sub>2</sub>O, 500; NaCl, 40; CuSO<sub>4</sub>.5H<sub>2</sub>O, 3; ZnSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 4; CoO<sub>4</sub>, 0.02; FeSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 20; MnSO<sub>4</sub>·H<sub>2</sub>O, 3; CaCo<sub>3</sub>, 215; MgOH, 124; Na<sub>2</sub>SeO<sub>3</sub>, 0.03; NaFl.

CMC: Carboxymethyl cellulose as binder.

<sup>d</sup> NFE: Nitrogen free extract.

#### <span id="page-2-0"></span>**Table 2**

Proximate composition (% dry matter) of different FAWM diets.

Proximate composition	Ingredients				
	Fermented Azolla	Fermented Pistia	Fermented Eicchornia		
Crude protein	34.78	32.95	30.12		
Crude lipid	9.20	8.30	5.30		
Crude ash	13.00	11.00	16.30		
Crude fibre	19.60	21.30	26.10		
Moisture	13.60	14.40	13.92		

◦C for later use. In addition, the proximate composition analysis of test diets and FAWM ingredients was performed in triplicate according to AOAC [\(1990\)](#page-8-0). Shortly, the examined samples were used for the following analyses: protein content using the Kjeldahl method (Model: BKD-8B, BIOBASE, China), lipid content by using the Soxhlet apparatus (Model: BFA-2, BIOBASE, China), moisture content by heating at 105 ◦C in an oven (Model: BOV-V30F, BIOBASE, China) until a constant weight was achieved, and ash content using a Muffle furnace (Model: MC5–12, BIOBASE, China) at 550 ◦C for 6 h.

# *2.3. Fish collection and rearing*

A total of 1000 Asian catfish fingerlings (average weight: 3.50  $\pm$ 0.08 g) were purchased from BRAC fish hatchery, Sreemongal, Sylhet. The fingerlings were acclimatized in five glass aquariums (60  $\times$  30  $\times$ 20 cm) for two weeks and fed twice daily with a basal diet (ACI Catfish Feed Ltd., Bangladesh; 35 % CP and 8 % crude lipid). Subsequently, 360 fish were randomly selected and distributed equally into 12 tanks, 90 L each ( $n = 30/tank$ ). The formulated diets were provided to the fish at satiation twice daily (9.00 am and 5.00 pm) during a 90-day feeding trial. Water quality variables such as temperature, pH, and dissolved oxygen were measured using multiparameter probe (Model: HI 9828, Hanna Instrument, USA), while ammonia and nitrite levels were monitored by HACH kit (Model: HI 28049, HACH, USA). Siphoning was performed every three days interval to maintain water quality. Throughout the experiment: temperature = 29.86-30  $°C$ , DO = 5.02–5.40 mg/L, pH = 7.06–7.49, ammonia = 0.12–0.15 mg/L, and nitrite: 0.09–0.12 mg/L were found.

### *2.4. Growth performance of Asian catfish*

At the end of the feeding trial, ten fish from each tank were randomly harvested and anesthetized using  $MS<sub>222</sub>$  (0.1 g/L water). The growth parameters (total length, body weight, and total biomass) were recorded. Moreover, the fish mortality and total feed consumption were recorded daily. The growth performance of the fish was analyzed using the following formulae [\(Kabir](#page-9-0) et al., 2024; Sezu et al., [2024](#page-10-0)):

- a) Weight gain (%) = 100 X (Final weight-Initial weight)/Initial weight
- b) Specific growth rate (%/day) =  $100$  X In (Final weight)- In (Initial weight)/Days
- c) Feed conversion ratio (FCR) = Total feed consumed/Live weight gain
- d) Protein efficiency ratio (PER) = Live weight gain/Crude protein fed
- e) Survival rate (%) = 100 X Number of survive fish/Total number of fish rearing
- f) Condition factor (gcm $^{-3}$ ) = 100 X Weight of body fish/(Total length of  $fish)^3$

# *2.5. Whole-body proximate composition analysis*

Dried whole fish from each treatment group in triplicates were used for biochemical composition analysis according to the AOAC [\(1990\)](#page-8-0) guidelines. Crude protein content was assessed using the Kjeldahl method (Model: BKD-8B, BIOBASE, China). In brief, approximately 0.5 g of the sample was placed in test tubes. Each sample in the Kjeldahl tube was treated with a catalyst mixture  $(K_2SO_4:CuSO_4 = 9:1)$  and 25 ml of H2SO4.The Kjeldahl tubes were then placed in a Kjeldahl digestion unit, where the organic nitrogen was converted into ammonium sulfate through digestion at 350–380 °C with concentrated  $H_2SO_4$  in the Kjeldahl flask. After that, about 300 ml of distilled water was added to each Kjeldahl tube. For the distillation process, 100 ml of 35 % NaOH solution was added to each tube. In the meantime, a 25 ml solution of 4 % boric acid, with 2–3 drops of an indicator (a mixture of bromocresol green and methyl red), was prepared in a conical flask. The distillation was carried out until 75 ml of the boric acid solution was collected in the conical flask. Following distillation, the solution in the conical flask was titrated with 0.1 N HCl until the solution turned pink. The initial and final readings of the HCl were recorded, and the crude protein content (% N  $\times$ 6.25) of each sample was estimated.

Fat content was determined using a Soxhlet apparatus (Model: BFA-2, BIOBASE, China). First, about 3 g of each sample were weighed and placed in a thimble paper, which was then set into the Soxhlet apparatus. Acetone (150–180 ml) was added to the round-bottom flask of the apparatus. The system was maintained at around 70  $\degree$ C for 3 h. During this process, acetone (Merck, KGaA, Germany) was evaporated and condensed, with its concentration gradually decreasing. The solvent containing lipids was siphoned into the flask and all lipid-extracted samples were collected. The solvent was transferred to a pre-weighed beaker and placed in an oven at 105 ◦C for 30 min to evaporate the acetone. After cooling in a desiccator for 15 min, the beaker was weighed again. The crude lipid (%) in the sample was then calculated based on the weight difference.

Ash content was performed employing a Muffle furnace (Model: MC5–12, BIOBASE, China). Briefly, each empty crucible was individually marked and weighed. About 2 g of each sample were placed into the crucible, which was then weighed again. The crucible with the sample was then placed in a muffle furnace at 550 ℃ for 6 h, followed by cooling overnight. After that, the crucible was transferred to a desiccator to further cool. Finally, the crucible with the sample was weighed again, and the percentage of ash content was calculated.

Moisture content of samples was determined by using a hot air oven (Model: BJPX-HGZ30L, BIOBASE, China). For this purpose, the weight of each marked empty crucible was recorded. About 2 g of each sample were added to the crucibles, which were then placed in a hot air oven at 105 ◦C for 24 hrs. Afterward, the crucibles were transferred to a desiccator for 15 min to cool. The final weight of each sample was measured, and the moisture percentage was calculated.

# *2.6. Gut microbial analysis of experimental fish*

The intestinal lactic acid bacteria (LAB) and total bacterial (TB) loads were determined as per Nandi et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) with minor modifications. In short, the fish were ventrally dissected using sharp scissors and the body cavity of each fish was opened to extract the gut. After that, fish intestine (1 g) was taken and cut into smaller pieces before being vortexed (Vortex Mixer, Model: BJPX-VW, BIOBASE, China) with a sterile solution (1:9). Subsequently, the samples were diluted ( $10^{-1}$  to  $10^{-10}$ ) and plated on de Man, Rogosa and Sharpe (MRS) agar (HiMedia, India) and nutrient agar (HiMedia, India) for LAB and TB enumeration, respectively. The culture plates were incubated at 37 ◦C for 36 hours.

### *2.7. Blood hematology and serum biochemical assays*

Fish from each replication group were randomly selected  $(n = 3)$  and anesthetized using  $MS_{222}$  (0.1 g/L water). Following that, about 150 µl of blood was collected from the dorsal vein after being fasted for 12 h using a 1 cc syringe and preserved in heparinized tubes. Hematological profiles were analyzed using an automatic hematology analyzer (Mythic Vet 18, USA). Meanwhile, an additional 300 µl blood was collected from each tank containing fish and kept into cellular serum tubes. The blood samples were then centrifuged at 3000 rpm for 10 min to isolate serum. Subsequently, around 150 µl of serum was drawn in an automatic blood analyzer (Beckman Coulter AU680, USA) to evaluate the biochemical indices of fish such as albumin, glucose, total bilirubin, creatinine, serum glutamic pyruvic transaminase, alkaline phosphatase, serum glutamic oxaloacetic transaminase, cholesterol, alanine aminotransferase, total protein, aspartate aminotransferase, and globulin.

#### *2.8. Histopathology of mid intestine and liver*

Fish from each tank were randomly selected  $(n = 3)$ , placed in separate tanks, and fasted for 72 h to empty their guts. After being anesthetized with  $MS<sub>222</sub>$  (0.1 g/L water, Syndel, Canada), the fish were dissected with sharp scissors from anus to head to collect their liver and mid gut tissues. A fresh and unused surgical blade was used for dissecting tissue samples to avoid any rough edges, squeezing, or abrasion and then preserved in 10 % neutral buffered formalin solution (Merck KGaA, Germany) for 72 h. The prepared tissue segments (2 mm thickness) were dehydrated using Carnoy's solution (a mixture of 60 % 2 propanol, 30 % chloroform and glacial acetic acid 10 %) and 2-propanol (Merck, Germany), cleaned with xylene (Merck KGaA, Germany), embedded in pure paraffin (Merck, Germany), and sectioned  $(6 \mu m)$  by a microtome machine (Leitz, 1512, USA) for hematoxylin and eosin (H&E) staining (Sigma-Aldrich, Merck, Germany). The slides were observed under a light microscope (Olympus BX43, Tokyo, Japan) and visualized using Image J software (Wayne Rasband) to determine the crypt depth, width, and villi length.

#### *2.9. Farm economic analysis*

The cost of raw materials used in the feed formulation was determined by summing up the cost of each ingredient. Subsequently, the farm feed cost, total yield, farm revenue, farm raw margin and return on investment were analyzed to evaluate farm economics using the following formulae [\(Suma](#page-10-0) et al., 2023):

- i. Farm feed cost, FFC (US\$/kg) = FCR x raw materials cost
- ii. Total yield, TY (kg/m $^2$ ) = Total biomass gain/ tank area
- iii. Farm revenue was determined on an estimated farm gate price of US\$ 7.38/ kg for Asian catfish, FR (US\$/m<sup>2</sup>) = TY  $\times$  7.38
- iv. Farm raw margin, FRM (US\$/m $^2$ ) = FR (TY  $\times$  FFC)
- v. Return on investment, ROI (%) = 100 x FRM/ (TY  $\times$  FFC)

# *2.10. Statistical analysis*

All the data were assessed for normality before conducting the statistical analysis. One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was performed using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20.1 (IBM, USA) to ascertain the significant differences between the treatment groups, followed by Duncan's multiple range test. The significance level was set at  $p<$  0.05, and the results were presented as mean  $\pm$ standard deviation (SD).

# **3. Results**

# *3.1. Growth performance of Asian catfish*

The growth performance of fish fed the control and FAWM diets is illustrated in Table 3. There were highly significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) differences in the growth performance of fish among the various treatments. The control fish exhibited significantly (p *<* 0.05) superior growth and feed utilization than the other treatment groups. Nonetheless, among the FAWM dietary groups, the  $D_1$  diet consumed fish recorded the significant (p*<* 0.05) highest FW (g), WG (%), TB (g), SGR (%/ day), and PER and the lowest FCR. Meanwhile, the D<sub>3</sub>-treated fish demonstrated the significant  $(p < 0.05)$  lowest growth performance and the highest

#### **Table 3**

Growth and feed utilization parameters of *C. batrachus* fed with control and experimental diets for 90 days.

Parameters	Diets (% FAWM)				
	$D_0$	$D_1$ D <sub>2</sub>		$D_3$	
IW $(g)$	$3.50 \pm 0.01$	$3.50 \pm 0.01$	$3.50 \pm 0.00$	$3.50 \pm 0.00$	
FW(g)	$28.32 + 0.43^a$	$25.51 \pm$	$23.52 +$	$20.90 \pm$	
		$0.14^{b}$	0.09 <sup>c</sup>	$0.15^d$	
WG (%)	$708.11 \pm$	627.75 $\pm$	571.88 $\pm$	496.96 $\pm$	
	$12.48^{\rm a}$	4.04 <sup>b</sup>	2.49 <sup>c</sup>	4.11 <sup>d</sup>	
TB(g)	744.42 $\pm$	660.10 $\pm$	$600.69 \pm$	521.85 $\pm$	
	$12.80^{a}$	4.29 <sup>b</sup>	2.72 <sup>c</sup>	4.40 <sup>d</sup>	
SGR	$1.88 \pm 0.02^a$	$1.79 + 0.01^{\rm b}$	$1.72 \pm 0.01^c$	$1.61 + 0.01^d$	
$(\frac{6}{day})$					
FCR	$1.30 + 0.02^d$	$1.51 + 0.01^{\circ}$	$1.72 + 0.01^{\rm b}$	$1.81 + 0.01^a$	
<b>PER</b>	$2.58 + 0.03^a$	$2.21 + 0.02^b$	$1.94 + 0.01^{\circ}$	$1.84 + 0.01^d$	
SR (%)	$95.00 \pm 5.00$	$98.33 \pm 2.89$	$96.67 \pm 2.89$	$96.67 \pm 2.89$	
$CF (gcm^{-3})$	$0.58 \pm 0.01^{\circ}$	$0.75 + 0.00^b$	$0.85 + 0.00^a$	$0.84 \pm 0.01^{\circ}$	

Note: IW: Initial weight, FW: Final weight, WG: Weight gain, TB: Total biomass, SGR: Specific growth rate, FCR: Feed conversion ratio, PER: Protein efficiency ratio, SR: Survival rate, CF: Condition factor. Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences (p *<* 0.05). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

FCR. The survival rate did not significantly (p *>* 0.05) differ between the treatment groups. Furthermore, D<sub>0</sub>-fed fish had a remarkably (p < 0.05) lower CF  $(g \text{ cm}^{-3})$  than the other experimental fish.

### *3.2. Gut microbial analysis of experimental fish*

The bacterial quantification in the guts of experimental fish is presented in Table 4. The TB and LAB counts in the fish intestine fluctuated significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) among the treatment groups. In  $D_1$  fish, both TB and LAB counts were significantly (p *<* 0.05) higher compared to other catfish groups, although TB counts did not significantly vary in the  $D_2$ fish gut. On the other hand, fish in the control group had markedly (p *<* 0.05) lower TB and LAB in their intestine.

#### *3.3. Whole-body proximate composition analysis*

[Table](#page-4-0) 5 displays the whole-body biochemical composition of Asian catfish. There were significant (p *<* 0.05) differences in the proximate composition, including crude protein, crude lipid, and moisture content, among the fish fed with different experimental diets. Interestingly,  $D_1$ fish recorded significantly (p *<* 0.05) higher crude protein and lower crude lipid and moisture content compared to other treatment groups, although no significant variations were noted in the crude lipid values between the  $D_0$  and  $D_3$  treatments. However, the ash content of fish was not significantly affected (p *>* 0.05) by the FAWM diets.

#### *3.4. Blood hematological assays*

The hematological indices of Asian catfish treated with experimental diets are detailed in [Table](#page-4-0) 6. The statistical analysis showed that fish fed







Notes:  $TB = Total bacteria$ ,  $LAB = Lactic acid bacteria$ . Different superscript alphabet in each row denote statistical differences (p *<* 0.05). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

#### <span id="page-4-0"></span>**Table 5**

Whole body proximate composition (% dry matter) of fish fed with different experimental diets (n=3).

Parameters	Diets (% FAWM)			
	$D_0$	$D_1$	D,	$D_{3}$
Crude protein Crude lipid Crude ash Moisture	$62.65 +$ $0.85^{\rm b}$ $8.65 \pm 0.66^{ab}$ $16.05 + 0.14$ $10.68 +$ 0.51 <sup>a</sup>	$64.27 +$ $0.40^a$ $8.24 + 0.28^b$ $16.21 + 0.86$ $9.35 + 0.27^b$	$62.36 +$ $0.52^{\rm b}$ $9.01 + 0.08^a$ $15.76 + 0.41$ $10.50 +$ $0.43^a$	$62.34 +$ $0.58^{\rm b}$ $8.45 \pm 0.23^{ab}$ $16.39 + 0.56$ $10.68 +$ 0.67 <sup>a</sup>

Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences (p *<* 0.05). The data are presented as mean  $+$  SD.

#### **Table 6**

Hematological indices of Asian catfish fed with different FAWM and control diets over 90 days of the experiment (n=3).

Parameter	Diets (% FAWM)			
	$D_0$	$D_1$	D <sub>2</sub>	$D_3$
WBC $(10^9/$	$541.60 \pm 0.60$	$541.82 +$	542.21 $\pm$	541.55 $\pm$
L)		0.43	0.10	0.55
NEU (%)	$0.56 \pm 0.02$	$0.60 \pm 0.08$	$0.57 \pm 0.10$	$0.54 \pm 0.01$
LYM(%)	$0.32 \pm 0.01^{\rm b}$	$0.74 \pm 0.11^a$	$0.64 \pm 0.01^a$	$0.66 \pm 0.05^{\text{a}}$
MON (%)	$0.04 \pm 0.01$	$0.06 \pm 0.04$	$0.04 \pm 0.01$	$0.04 \pm 0.03$
EOS (%)	$0.02 \pm 0.01$	$0.02 \pm 0.02$	$0.03 \pm 0.02$	$0.04 \pm 0.04$
<b>BAS</b> (%)	$0.06 \pm 0.02^a$	$0.07 \pm 0.02^{\rm a}$	$0.03 \pm 0.02^b$	$0.02 \pm 0.01^{\rm b}$
RBC $(10^{12}/$	$2.54 \pm 0.50^{\circ}$	$5.93 \pm 0.16^a$	$6.03 \pm 0.09^a$	$3.95 \pm 0.04^{\rm b}$
L)				
HGB (g/L)	$84.33 \pm 3.06^b$	$91.00 \pm$	$64.67 \pm 1.53$ <sup>c</sup>	$47.99 \pm 1.01^d$
		6.00 <sup>a</sup>		
HCT(%)	$0.20 \pm 0.02^c$	$0.54 \pm 0.10^a$	$0.37 \pm 0.07^{\rm b}$	$0.33 \pm 0.05^{\rm bc}$
MCV (fL)	$86.07 \pm 1.1^a$	$80.43 \pm$	$80.37 \pm 0.65^{\rm b}$	$84.23 \pm 3.39^a$
		0.74 <sup>b</sup>		
MCH(pg)	$32.72 \pm 0.49$	$31.35 \pm 2.07$	$30.93 \pm 4.68$	$33.95 \pm 2.59$
MCHC (g/L)	408.00 $\pm$	524.00 $\pm$	394.00 $\pm$	434.67 $\pm$
	$15.13$ <sup>bc</sup>	4.36 <sup>a</sup>	$24.06^{\circ}$	$12.70^{b}$
RDW-CV	$0.17 \pm 0.05$	$0.18 \pm 0.02$	$0.15 \pm 0.02$	$0.16 \pm 0.01$
f(L)				
RDW-SD	$60.37 \pm 5.01$	$57.34 \pm 1.16$	$53.07 \pm 6.93$	$53.04 \pm 6.96$
f(L)				
PLT $(10^9/L)$	$290.03 \pm$	$290.37 \pm$	$256.07 \pm$	$313.47 \pm$
	8.26 <sup>b</sup>	2.01 <sup>b</sup>	12.94 <sup>c</sup>	5.13 <sup>a</sup>
MPV (fL)	$7.41 \pm 0.62$	$7.81 \pm 0.75$	$7.23 \pm 0.93$	$6.70 \pm 0.50$
PDW (%)	$16.83 \pm 0.57^{\rm b}$	$18.08 \pm$	$17.69 \pm$	$18.23 \pm 0.12^a$
		$0.85$ <sup>a</sup>	$0.42^{ab}$	
$PCT$ (ml/L)	$2.73 \pm 0.45^a$	$2.26 \pm$	$1.93 \pm 0.02^{\rm b}$	$2.28 \pm 0.31^{ab}$
		0.57 <sup>ab</sup>		

Note: WBC: White blood cell, NEU: Neutrophil, LYM: Lymphocytosis, MON: Monocytes, EOS: Eosinophil, BAS: Basophil, RBC: Red blood cell, HGB: Hemoglobin, HCT: Hematocrit, MCV: Mean corpuscular volume, MCH: Mean corpuscular hemoglobin, MCHC: Mean corpuscular hemoglobin concentration, RDW-CV: Red cell distribution width-coefficient of variation, RDW-SD: Red cell distribution width-standard deviation, PLT: Platelet, MPV: Mean platelet volume, PDW: Platelet distribution width, PCT: Procalcitonin. Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences (p *<* 0.05). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

with the  $D_2$  diet had notably ( $p < 0.05$ ) elevated LYM, BAS, RBC, HGB, HCT, MCHC, and PDW levels. Conversely, the control group exhibited significantly (p *<* 0.05) lower levels of LYM, RBC, HCT, MCHC, and PDW. The HGB content was dramatically reduced in the  $D_3$  group. However, other hematological traits, including WBC, NEU, MON, EOS, MCH, RDW-CV, RDW-SD, and MPV, were not significantly different (p*>*0.05) between the treatments.

## *3.5. Serum biochemical assays*

Table 7 demonstrates the serum biochemical profile of fish fed the FAWM and control diets. The results revealed that various dietary

#### **Table 7**

Blood biochemical parameters of fish when treated with different test diets for 90 days of the experiment  $(n = 3)$ .

Parameters	Diets (% FAWM)			
	$D_0$	$D_1$	D <sub>2</sub>	$D_3$
GLU (mmol/ L)	$3.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm b}$	$4.33 \pm 0.58^{\rm b}$	$9.00 \pm 1.00^a$	$4.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm b}$
$CREA$ $(mg/$ dL)	$0.47 \pm 0.06^{\rm b}$	$0.20 \pm 0.01^d$	$0.35 \pm 0.01^{\circ}$	$0.83 \pm 0.02^a$
TBIL (mg/dL)	55.83 $\pm$	$35.70 \pm$	$18.10 +$	$12.03 \pm$
	$0.76^{\rm a}$	$0.20^{b}$	0.10 <sup>c</sup>	$0.15^d$
ALT $(\mu/L)$	$9.67 \pm$	$6.67 \pm 0.58$ <sup>c</sup>	$10.67 +$	$8.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm b}$
	$0.58^{ab}$		$0.58^{a}$	
BUN (mg/dL)	$57.50 \pm 0.50$	$48.83 \pm 0.29$	$74.50 \pm 0.50$	$86.40 \pm 0.36$
AST $(\mu/L)$	$7.50 \pm 1.89^b$	$4.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm d}$	$20.67 +$	$6.40 \pm 1.85^c$
			4.01 <sup>a</sup>	
ALB $(g/dL)$	$4.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm d}$	$7.50 \pm 0.50^{\rm b}$	$8.67 \pm 0.58^{\rm a}$	$6.40 \pm 0.36^c$
ALKP $(\mu/L)$	$8.40 \pm 0.36^{\circ}$	$8.10 \pm 0.10^a$	$6.50 \pm 0.20^b$	$5.73 \pm 0.15^c$
CHOL(g/dL)	$9.03 \pm 0.06^{\circ}$	$11.97 +$	$5.60 \pm 0.53^{\rm d}$	$14.27 +$
		0.06 <sup>b</sup>		$0.25^{\rm a}$
TP(g/dL)	$9.10 \pm 0.10^{\rm d}$	25.50 $\pm$	$19.60 \pm$	14.50 $\pm$
		$1.32^{a}$	$0.53^{b}$	0.50 <sup>c</sup>
GLOB(g/dL)	$6.50 \pm 0.30^{\circ}$	$10.90 \pm$	$5.67 \pm 0.15^{\rm d}$	$7.00 \pm 0.10^{\rm b}$
		$0.10^{a}$		

Note: GLU: Glucose, CREA: Creatinine, TBIL: Total bilirubin, BUN: Blood urea nitrogen, ALB: Albumin, ALKP: Alkaline phosphatase, CHOL: Cholesterol, TP: Total protein, GLOB: Globulin, ALT: Alanine aminotransferase, AST: Aspartate aminotransferase. Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences ( $p < 0.05$ ). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

groups significantly (p *<* 0.05) impacted the serum biochemical composition of Asian catfish. Fish group that were consumed  $D_1$  diet displayed substantial (p *<* 0.05) lower GLU, CREA, and AST contents and higher TP and GLOB levels compared to other dietary treatments, although the GLU level was statistically similar in the  $D_0$  and  $D_3$  groups. Meanwhile, the control group exhibited significantly (p *<* 0.05) higher TBIL, ALKP, and ALT, and lower ALB and TP than other test groups. The CHOL level differed significantly (p *<* 0.05) between the treatments, with the lowest value detected in the  $D_2$  fish. Despite that, none of the dietary treatments influenced the fish BUN level.

#### *3.6. Histopathology of mid-intestine and liver*

[Fig.](#page-5-0) 1 depicts the histological changes in the fish mid-intestine after being treated with FAWM and control diets. Morphological alterations were observed in the lamina propria, lamina epithelial mucosae, stratum compactum, goblet cells, and tunica muscularis. The control group exhibited improved intestinal health, characterized by more villi, increased goblet cells and a larger lamina propria. In contrast, 50 % FAWM protein supplementation was detrimental to the fish gut, except for the  $D_1$  diet. The  $D_1$  diet group displayed an effective epithelial barrier with increased goblet cells, expanded villi, and a well-developed stratum compactum in their gut. Conversely, the  $D_2$  and  $D_3$  diet groups exhibited irregular villi structure and a wider tunica muscularis rather than other treatments fish.

[Fig.](#page-5-0) 2 illustrates the Asian catfish liver histology upon supplementation with various experimental diets, showcasing alterations in nuclei, vacuoles, sinusoids, erythrocytes, and other signs of hemorrhagic or degenerative activities. These findings indicated that *C. batrachus* fed the D1 and D2 diets had improved liver health, characterized by more nuclei and sinusoids and reduced vacuolar cytoplasm. On the contrary, hepatic disorders such as more vacuoles, degenerative nuclei, and erythrocyte infiltration were observed in the liver of fish fed the  $D_0$  and  $D_3$  diets.

# *3.7. Estimation of villi height, width, and crypt depth*

[Table](#page-6-0) 8 shows the morphological analysis of the midgut of fish that received various experimental diets. The inclusion of FAWM protein

<span id="page-5-0"></span>

**Fig. 1.** Histopathological images of the mid intestine of Asian catfish fed with experimental diets. All micrographs were captured at 10X magnification and 50 µm scale bar. The histological variations were observed in (a) lamina propria, (b) lamina epithelial mucosae, (c) stratum compactum, (d) goblet cell, and (e) tunica muscularis.



**Fig. 2.** Light microscopic investigation of Asian catfish liver fed various experimental diets for 90 days. The images were obtained at 10X magnifications and 50 µm scale bar. The morphological changes were observed in the nucleus (N), sinusoid (S), vacuole (V), erythrocyte (E), erythrocyte infiltration into blood sinusoid (ES), hemorrhage (H), and bile duct (BD).

significantly (p *<* 0.05) affected both villi width and crypt depth, with notably lower values observed in the control fish. However, there was no statistical variation in villi width found in the  $D_3$  diet group. Nevertheless, villi length did not substantially (p*>*0.05) differ between the treatment groups.

#### *3.8. Farm economic analysis*

The inclusion of 50 % FAWM protein boosted farm economic efficiency by extensively reducing the FFC [\(Table](#page-6-0) 9). Interestingly, the significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) lowest FFC was observed in the  $D_1$  diet group, besides boasting significantly higher ROI. Moreover, TY, FR, and FRM were considerably (p *<* 0.05) higher in control group. However, amongst the FAWM dietary groups,  $D_1$  diet fed fish showed noteworthy

#### <span id="page-6-0"></span>**Table 8**

Mid-intestinal morphology of *C. batrachus* fed with different FAWM proteins (n  $= 3$ .

Parameters	Diets (% FAWM)				
	Intestinal region	$D_0$	D1	D <sub>2</sub>	$D_3$
Villi length	Mid gut	$134.68 +$ 49.24	$137.78 +$ 25.86	$123.23 +$ 22.68	$113.69 +$ 22.29
Villi width	Mid gut	$31.20 +$ $4.36^{b}$	$42.93 +$ $10.58^{a}$	$41.35 +$ $5.35^{a}$	$29.72 +$ $7.66^b$
Crypt depth	Mid gut	$14.59 +$ 4.03 <sup>b</sup>	$19.83 +$ 2.38 <sup>ab</sup>	$25.50 +$ $7.58^{a}$	$23.20 +$ 8.60 <sup>a</sup>

Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences (p *<* 0.05). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

### **Table 9**

Farm economic efficiency resulting from Asian catfish feeding trial after 90 days  $(n=3)$ 

Parameters	Diets (% FAWM)			
	$D_0$	$D_1$ D <sub>2</sub>		$D_3$
$TY$ (kg/m <sup>2</sup> ) FFC (US\$/kg) $FR (US\$/m^2)$	$7.44 + 0.13a$ $1.38 \pm 0.02^a$ $54.94 +$ $0.95^{\rm a}$	$6.60 \pm 0.14^b$ $1.07 + 0.01^d$ $48.72 +$ 0.31 <sup>b</sup>	$6.01 + 0.03^c$ $1.23 \pm 0.00^{\circ}$ $44.33 +$ 0.20 <sup>c</sup>	$5.22 \pm 0.04^d$ $1.31 \pm 0.01^{\rm b}$ $38.51 \pm$ $0.33^{d}$
FRM (US $\frac{\text{m}^2}{\text{m}^2}$ ROI (%)	44.66 $\pm$ $0.90^{\rm a}$ 434.34 $\pm$ 6.66 <sup>d</sup>	41.65 $\pm$ $0.33^{b}$ 589.08 $\pm$ 5.99 <sup>a</sup>	$36.94 \pm$ $0.17^{\circ}$ 499.68 $\pm$ 1.96 <sup>b</sup>	$31.66 \pm$ $0.24^d$ 461.75 $\pm$ 2.32 <sup>c</sup>

Note: TY, Total yield; FFC, Farm feed cost; FR, Farm revenue; FRM, Farm raw margin; ROI, Return on investment. Different superscript alphabets in each row denote statistical differences ( $p < 0.05$ ). The data are presented as mean  $\pm$  SD.

(p *<* 0.05) higher levels of these parameters.

# **4. Discussion**

The FAWM is a promising and sustainable protein source for aquafeed development due to its superior nutritional profile, abundance, and low production cost. In this study, different FAWM were incorporated in diets (50 % of the total protein) to determine the impacts on growth metrics, nutrient utilization, gut microbiota, biochemical composition, blood metrics, liver & intestinal health of Asian catfish, and assess the economic efficiency of the experimental feed. Fermenting aquatic weeds with 0.001 % *L. acidophilus* enhances their nutritional profile by converting polysaccharides into protein, reducing ANFs, and improving digestibility and absorption in fish [\(Hayati](#page-9-0) et al., 2023; Li et al., [2022\)](#page-9-0). Numerous studies have demonstrated that using 50 % fermented plant ingredients or protein enhances fish productivity and overall health condition (Aragão et al., 2022; Kari et al., 2022; Mugwanya et al., 2023; Nandi et al., 2023; [Rajaram](#page-8-0) et al., 2022; Seong et al., 2018; [Zulhisyam](#page-8-0) et al., 2020). Thus, this study included 50 % protein from FAWM as the total protein in experimental diets.

This study finding's indicated that the fish supplemented with the  $D_0$ diet exhibited the significantly highest growth performance and feed utilization. The results observed in control fish supplemented with the FM-based diet might be credited to its high protein content, balanced nutrient profile, optimal amino acid composition, and digestibility. Despite that, the  $D_1$  diet group exhibited significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) higher FW, WG, TB, SGR, FCR, and PER than other treatments. These favorable outcomes are possibly due to the more digestible protein in fermented *Azolla*, enabling the fish to efficiently digest and absorb nutrients, thereby supporting their somatic growth. Liu et al. [\(2023\)](#page-9-0) stated that fermentation of plant ingredients with *Lactobacillus* spp. improves fish growth and feed utilization by enhancing digestion, synthesizing nutrients, producing growth-promoting metabolites, modulating gut

microbiota, and reducing competition from pathogens. Likewise, fermented plant protein supplemented in other fish species have yielded promising outcomes, including *Barbonymus gonionotus* (Das et al., [2018](#page-8-0)), *O. niloticus* ([Yousif](#page-10-0) et al., 2019), *Clarias gariepinus* [\(Irabor](#page-9-0) et al., 2022; Kari et al., [2022\)](#page-9-0), *Oncorhynchus mykiss* ([Davies](#page-8-0) et al., 2021), and *Labeo rohita* [\(Ferdous](#page-9-0) et al., 2023). Moreover, Nandi et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) reported that the SSF of plant-derived ingredients using 0.001 % *Lactobacillus* reduced ANFs, improved nutritional value, and boosted fish production when included optimally in their diet. Supplementation with beneficial microbes in fish diets can also improve the FCR of aquatic animals ([Flefil](#page-9-0) et al., 2022; [Kapka-Skrzypczak](#page-9-0) et al., 2012; Sadia et al., 2023; Veisi et al., [2023\)](#page-9-0). In contrast, the  $D_3$  diet group demonstrated lower growth performance compared to other treatment groups. The higher inclusion of dietary *Eicchornia* meal increased ANFs and fiber content, potentially reducing fish growth. Multiple reports (Gatlin III et al., 2007; [Torstensen](#page-9-0) et al., 2008; [Welker](#page-9-0) et al., 2016; Yu et al., 2015) have documented that high dietary plant protein lowered feed digestibility and palatability. In this study, the survival rate for all groups exceeded 95 %, with no significant differences, indicating that FAWM did not influence fish mortality. Abdul Kari et al. [\(2021\)](#page-8-0) found similar results with African catfish fed various proportions of fermented soy pulp. Additionally, the CF was substantially higher in FAWM diet groups compared to the control, consistent with earlier findings (Lee et al., [2016;](#page-9-0) Zhou et al., 2011). A higher CF suggests that the fish are in good condition.

The fish gut microbial quantification results indicated that *Lactobacillus* fermentation significantly impacted the intestinal TB and LAB counts, particularly in the *Azolla* (D<sub>1</sub>) diet group, which recorded the highest bacterial counts. *Azolla* is known to act as a prebiotic, containing substances that stimulate the growth and activity of beneficial microbes in the intestine (de la Cruz et al., [2023](#page-8-0)). The combination of *Lactobacillus* fermentation and *Azolla* treatment might have resulted in a synergistic effect, further enhancing both probiotic and prebiotic activities. This interaction probably led to the highest counts of beneficial bacteria, demonstrating improved intestinal health, defense mechanisms, and disease resistance in fish fed with a  $D_1$  diet compared to other treatments. Chai et al. [\(2019\)](#page-8-0) noted that during fermentation, microorganisms generate antimicrobial peptides that might have an inhibitory and killing effect on pathogenic microbes. In addition, delivering lactic acid bacteria into fish intestine through their feed has been proven effective in enhancing fish growth performance (Aliyu-A et al., 2019; de [Oliveira](#page-8-0) et al., 2015; Ringø et al., 2018; Seal et al., 2018; [Zulhisyam](#page-8-0) et al., 2020), health status ([Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al., 2021; Kari et al., 2022), and disease resistance ([Verma](#page-10-0) et al., 2018). [Filannino](#page-9-0) et al. (2018) also reported that a higher LAB count in fish intestines increases lactic acid secretion, thus increasing digestive enzyme activities. Therefore, the current study's findings suggest that the dietary inclusion of FAWM protein (50 %) promotes beneficial microbiota growth in the distal intestine of fish.

The fish's whole-body biochemical profile is a critical indicator of food quality. The present study showed that FAWM significantly influenced the fish's whole-body composition, with the significantly highest CP detected in fish fed with fermented  $Azolla$  (D<sub>1</sub>). Fermentation possibly improves protein bioavailability and digestibility, facilitating absorption and protein synthesis in the body. Similarly, [Refaey](#page-10-0) et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) reported increased CP content in the whole-body of *O. niloticus* when supplemented with 20 % *Azolla* meal. Nonetheless, [Ahmed](#page-8-0) et al. [\(2019\)](#page-8-0) did not observe significant changes in fish CP levels when *Megalobrama amblycephala* were fed a diet formulated with plant protein. Furthermore, the considerably highest lipid content was recorded in fish provided with fermented *Pistia* (D<sub>2</sub>). Reduced feed intake potentially compromises protein utilization, resulting in ineffective protein synthesis in the fish's body. This condition promotes protein conversion into lipids for storage. Different levels of *P. stratiotes* incorporated into fish diets also led to varying lipid content in *L. rohita* (Nisha and [Geetha,](#page-10-0) [2017\)](#page-10-0), while *Oncorhynchus mykiss* fed with 40–60 % *Camelina sativa* meal yielded similar outcomes. Suma et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) documented that fish with high protein and low-fat content present an outstanding dietary

option for human consumption. Meanwhile, fish ash content was not affected by FAWM diets, which is in line with earlier findings ([Chen](#page-8-0) et al., 2020; [Huang](#page-8-0) et al., 2023; Zhao et al., 2021). This stability is likely due to the similar mineral composition of FAWM compared to the control feed, coupled with the fish's inherent ability to regulate mineral levels despite dietary differences. Overall, these findings contribute to our understanding of optimal dietary strategies for enhancing fish quality and nutritional value.

Blood hematological assays are common tools for evaluating fish health and physiology (Fazio, 2019; [Witeska](#page-9-0) et al., 2022). The hematological data indicated that the experimental diets did not significantly affect the WBC level, suggesting that FAWM protein had no adverse effects on fish immunity. Refaey et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) obtained corresponding result when Nile tilapia consumed different dietary inclusions of *Azolla* meal. The *Azolla* (D<sub>1</sub>) diet fed fish group had the highest mean values for LYM and BAS. Both *Lactobacillus* and *Azolla* are known to have immunomodulatory effects ([Bhattacharyya](#page-8-0) et al., 2016; Taverniti and [Guglielmetti,](#page-8-0) 2011). These effects could bolster the fish's immune system, leading to increased LYM and BAS counts. Lymphocytes are key cells in the adaptive immune response, while basophils play roles in allergic and parasitic responses [\(Nandi](#page-10-0) et al., 2024). Fish fed a diet incorporating 50 % fermented soy pulp showed elevated lymphocyte counts in African catfish [\(Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al., 2021). Nevertheless, the control fish had lower RBC and HCT counts than the FAWM diet groups, indicating the possibility of FAWM-stimulated erythropoiesis. [Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al. [\(2021\)](#page-8-0) stated that WBC, RBC, and HCT are significant indicators of fish health and antinutritional toxicity of feed. The blood HGB count was significant and highest in fish fed with the  $D_1$  diet. This result might be due to the combined effects of *Azolla*'s nutritional content, particularly its protein and iron bioavailability. The increased RBC and HGB could promote tissue oxygenation and fish growth, as supported by earlier studies [\(Esmaeili,](#page-9-0) 2021; Hossain et al., 2022). Numerous researches have highlighted variations in RBC, HGB, HCT, MCHC, PDW, and PCT levels in several fish species when fed various plant-protein diets (Dienye and [Olumuji,](#page-9-0) 2014; Farhad et al., 2023; [Zakaria](#page-9-0) et al., 2022), which aligns with the current findings. Meanwhile, the experimental diets did not affect other parameters such as NEU, MON, EOS, MCH, RDW-CV, RDW-SD, and MPV. Overall, these results reveal disparities in fish health and physiological states attributable to variations in hematological indices.

The experimental diets had notable impacts on fish's blood biochemical indices in the present study. For instance, the  $D_1$  group recorded lower blood GLU than other treatments, but GLU levels in the D0 and D3 groups were statistically similar. *Azolla* contains various phytochemicals such as polyphenols, flavonoids, and alkaloids, which have been documented to regulate glucose metabolism (Kösesakal and [Yıldız,](#page-9-0) 2019), potentially enhance insulin sensitivity, promote cellular glucose uptake, and inhibit liver glucose production, leading to reduced GLU. Nandi et al. [\(2023\)](#page-10-0) reported similar observations in *H. fossilis* fed with graded levels of FWM. In this study, the fish supplemented with a  $D_1$  diet exhibited significantly higher TP and GLOB contents. These outcomes were consistent with previous studies involving *O. niloticus* ([Magouz](#page-9-0) et al., 2020), *C. gariepinus* [\(Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al., 2021), and *H. fossilis* [\(Nandi](#page-10-0) et al., 2023). Fermentation is likely to improve the digestibility of *Azolla* meal, thereby increasing the nutrient availability and absorption. As a result, protein utilization is enhanced, contributing to higher TP and GLOB. Elevated TP represents superior fish immunity (Rebl and [Goldammer,](#page-10-0) 2018), while GLOB is a vital indicator of fish lipid catabolism and immune status ([Khalil](#page-9-0) et al., 2018, 2022). These changes also indicate enhanced energy production and liver function in the  $D_1$ diet group, which may boost the fish's immune system. However, the significantly elevated TBIL count in  $D_0$  fish contrasts with earlier findings ([Chaklader](#page-8-0) et al., 2020, 2021), implying a potential decline in liver function in the control group. In contrast, certain phytochemicals or microbial metabolites in the FAWM diets may support the liver's detoxification processes, resulting in better liver health.

The CHOL and ALB levels were highly significant across the various treatment groups, aligning with findings from previous studies [\(Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al., 2021; [Rahman](#page-8-0) et al., 2023). CHOL is essential for the body's physiological functions, but elevated levels can lead to health problems. In contrast, ALB contents are an indicative of fish's health, as deviations from normal values can signal issues such as malnutrition and liver dysfunction. Additionally, the experimental diets had a substantial impact on other critical parameters, including CREA, AST, ALT, and ALKP, all of which serve as indicators of the fish's general health.

The gut morphological investigation conducted in this study provides insights into the fish's nutrient absorption and immune status ([Abdel-Wareth](#page-8-0) et al., 2023; Dawood et al., 2020; Haygood and Jha, [2018\)](#page-8-0). According to Wang et al. [\(2018\)](#page-10-0), dietary nutrition is a primary factor influencing structural alterations in the fish's intestines. In the present study, the experimental diets substantially affected the fish's distal intestinal health at varying levels. For instance, the control group exhibited normal intestinal morphology, particularly in terms of villi structure, goblet cell arrangements, and tunica muscularis. This normal intestinal morphology in the control fish is likely due to the good quality protein, peptide, and EAAs, as well as the absence of ANFs in FM. Meanwhile, the  $D_1$  diet group had an extended lamina propria with significantly increased villi width and crypth depth and more goblet cells than other FAWM treatment groups. These findings indicate that dietary *A. pinnata* improved the fish's gut health by potentially enhancing digestion and nutrient absorption. Goblet cells in the villi of the small intestine are crucial for mucus production, maintaining gut barrier function, supporting immune defense, facilitating nutrient absorption, and preserving gut homeostasis, thereby contributing to overall gut health and function. The supplementation of dietary plant protein has yielded promising outcomes in *Lateolabrax japonicus* ([Zhang](#page-10-0) et al., [2018](#page-10-0)), *Micropterus salmoides* (Li et al., [2020\)](#page-9-0), *Ameiurus nebulosus* ([Matuli](#page-9-0)´c et al., 2020), *O. niloticus* [\(Ismail](#page-9-0) et al., 2022), *Scophthalmus maximus* L. (Li et al., [2022\)](#page-9-0), and *Labeo rohita* [\(Palaniyappan](#page-10-0) et al., 2023). Earlier studies discovered that goblet cells are critical indicators of nutrient digestion and absorption ([Pirarat](#page-10-0) et al., 2011). Elevated goblet cells are crucial for mucus secretion and combating ANFs ([Mzengereza](#page-9-0) et al., [2022\)](#page-9-0). The fish from the  $D_2$  and  $D_3$  groups exhibited abnormal gut morphology, characterized by microvilli disintegration, vacuole enlargement, increased connective tissue, and wider tunica muscularis. High crude fiber, ANFs, and other toxic elements in these dietary groups might cause these adverse impacts. Furthermore, the substantial thickening of the tunica muscularis in the  $D_3$  diet group suggests higher muscle contraction due to the migration of unabsorbed food particles into the rectum ([Nasruddin](#page-10-0) et al., 2014). In summary, incorporating 50 % protein from fermented *Azolla* meal in the *C. batrachus* diet promoted their nutrient absorption and health status compared to the other FAWM diets.

According to [Lozano](#page-9-0) et al. (2017), the liver is a crucial indicator of the fish's overall health. Morphological evaluation of the liver tissues revealed that fish supplemented with  $D_1$  and  $D_2$  diets had increased nuclei, reduced vacuolation, and no apparent hemorrhage or hepatocyte dissociation. This improvement is likely attributed to the *Lactobacillus* fermentation of the feed ingredients, which modulates gut microbiota, reinforces the gut barrier, supports detoxification, reduces oxidative stress, and exerts anti-inflammatory effects. These findings are supported by Vo et al. [\(2020\)](#page-10-0), Liu et al. [\(2021\)](#page-9-0), and Han et al. [\(2022\).](#page-9-0) In contrast, the  $D_0$  and  $D_3$  groups displayed poor liver health, characterized by increased vacuolation, extended hemorrhage, hepatocyte dissociation, and degenerative nuclei. These adverse outcomes may be attributed to the presence of indigestible nutrients in the fish diet. [Abdul](#page-8-0) Kari et al. [\(2021\)](#page-8-0) found analogous effects in African catfish liver when supplemented with 75 % −100 % fermented soy pulp meal. Additionally, substituting fish meal with 100 % plant protein led to more vacuole and fat accumulation in the liver of Gilthead Sea bream (Sitjà-Bobadilla et al., [2005\)](#page-10-0).

The economic analysis revealed that FAWM protein significantly

*Aquaculture Reports 38 (2024) 102305*

<span id="page-8-0"></span>reduced the FFC and increased ROI. FAWM offers economic benefits due to its locally available, low-cost production, contributing to reduced feed expenses and increased profitability in aquaculture operations. Precisely, the diet containing fermented *A. pinnata* had the lowest FFC among all dietary groups, highlighting its cost-effectiveness. Furthermore, the  $D_1$  diet group recorded the highest ROI, suggesting that fermented *Azolla pinnata* is a highly economical protein source for aquaculture diets. These findings underscore the potential economic benefits of utilizing FAWM in aquaculture feeds to save cost and improve ROI. This information is valuable for aquaculturists seeking sustainable, cost-effective solutions to boost their farm productivity.

# **5. Conclusion**

The study findings suggest that including 50 % FAWM protein in fish feed, particularly from fermented *A. pinnata,* significantly improved the growth performance, feed utilization, and health status of Asian catfish, while also boosting the farm's economic efficiency. Additionally, this study offers new opportunities for fish feed manufacturers to utilize FAWM-based protein to develop cost-effective diets for sustainable aquaculture, benefiting both the industry and end users.

# **Funding**

The authors thank the Department of Aquaculture, Sylhet Agricultural University, Bangladesh for Sylhet Agricultural University Research System (SAURES-UGC) and Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (FRGS), Malaysia, (Code: FRGS/1/2022/STG03/UMK/03/1) for funding this research. Authors (P.K) also acknowledge financial support from Abu Dhabi University's Office of Research and Sponsored Programs.

#### **CRediT authorship contribution statement**

**Muhammad Anamul Kabir:** Supervision, Funding acquisition. **Afrina Yeasmin Suma:** Writing – review & editing. **Sadia Afrin:** Writing – review & editing. **Suniza Anis Mohamad Sukri:** Writing – review & editing. **Zulhisyam Abdul Kari:** Supervision, Funding acquisition. **Nurdiyana Aqilah Roslan:** Writing – review & editing. **Martina Irwan Khoo:** Writing – review & editing. **Krishnakumar Velayudhannair:** Writing – review & editing, Funding acquisition, Conceptualization. **Ajay Guru:** Writing – review & editing. **Md. Shahab Uddin:** Writing – review & editing. **Parashuram Kallem:** Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Funding acquisition. **El-Sayed Hemdan Eissa:** Writing – review & editing. **Talukdar Jannat Tamanna Shimul:** Writing – original draft. **Shishir Kumar Nandi:** Writing – original draft.

# **Declaration of Competing Interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

# **Data availability**

Data will be made available on request.

# **Acknowledgments**

This article is a collaboration between Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Abu Dhabi University and Sylhet Agricultural University as part of the plan established by the Advanced Livestock and Aquaculture Research Group – ALAReG under the Faculty of Agro-Based Industry, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Jeli

#### **References**

- [Abdel-Wareth,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref1) M.T.A., Ali, E.A.M., El-Shazly, M.A., 2023. Biological activity and GC-MS/ MS analysis of extracts of [endophytic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref1) fungi isolated from Eichhornia crassipes (Mart.) Solms. J. Appl. [Biotechnol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref1) Rep. 10 (1), 895–909.
- Abdul Kari, Z., Kabir, M.A., Mat, K., Rusli, N.D., Razab, M.K.A.A., Ariff, N.S.N.A., Edinur, H.A., Rahim, M.Z.A., Pati, S., Dawood, M.A.O., Wei, L.S., 2021. The possibility of replacing fish meal with fermented soy pulp on the growth performance, blood biochemistry, liver, and intestinal morphology of African catfish (Clarias gariepinus). Aquac. Rep. 21, 100815 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2021.100815) [aqrep.2021.100815.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2021.100815)
- Ahmed, M., Liang, H., Chisomo Kasiya, H., Ji, K., Ge, X., Ren, M., Liu, B., Zhu, X., Sun, A., 2019. Complete replacement of fish meal by plant protein ingredients with dietary essential amino acids supplementation for juvenile blunt snout bream (Megalobrama amblycephala). Aquac. Nutr. 25 (1), 205–214. [https://doi.org/10.1111/anu.12844.](https://doi.org/10.1111/anu.12844) [Akankali,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref4) J., Elenwo, E., 2019. Use of water hyacinth as feed stuff for animals in Niger
- delta, [Nigeria.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref4) Int. J. Adv. Sci. Res. Rev. 4 (1), 91–97. Aliyu-A, A., Aliyu-Paiko, M., Abafi, J., Abdul-Malik, A., Adamu, K.M., King, M.A., 2019. Fermentation of feed ingredients as potential strategy to improve health status and
- reduce opportunistic pathogens in fish farming. Asian J. Biotechnol. Bioresour. Technol. 5 (2), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.9734/ajb2t/2019/v5i230055>. AOAC, M., 1990. [Association](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref6) of official analytical chemists. Official methods of analysis.
- AOAC: Off. [Methods](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref6) Anal. 1, 69–90.
- Aragão, C., Gonçalves, A.T., Costas, B., Azeredo, R., Xavier, M.J., Engrola, S., 2022. Alternative proteins for fish diets: implications beyond growth. Animals 12 (9), 1211. 〈<https://www.mdpi.com/2076-2615/12/9/1211>〉.
- Baruah, D., Borthakur, S., Baishya, S., [Bhagawati,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref8) K., Gogoi, K., 2018. Growth [Performance](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref8) of Labeo rohita (Hamilton) yearlings through use of fermented Ipomoea aquatica leaf meal as fish feed. J. [Entomol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref8) Zool. Stud. 6 (4), 1802–1812.
- [Bhattacharyya,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref9) A., Shukla, P.K., Roy, D., Shukla, M., 2016. Effect of Azolla supplementation on growth, [immunocompetence](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref9) and carcass characteristics of [commercial](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref9) broilers. J. Anim. Res. 6 (5), 941–945.
- Chai, T.-T., Tan, Y.-N., Ee, K.-Y., Xiao, J., Wong, F.-C., 2019. Seeds, fermented foods, and agricultural by-products as sources of plant-derived antibacterial peptides. Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nutr. 59 (sup1), S162–S177. [https://doi.org/10.1080/](https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2018.1561418) [10408398.2018.1561418](https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2018.1561418).
- Chaklader, M.R., Fotedar, R., Howieson, J., Siddik, M.A.B., Foysal, M.J., 2020. The ameliorative effects of various fish protein hydrolysates in poultry by-product meal based diets on muscle quality, serum biochemistry and immunity in juvenile barramundi, Lates calcarifer. Fish. Shellfish Immunol. 104, 567–578. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2020.06.014) [org/10.1016/j.fsi.2020.06.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2020.06.014).
- Chaklader, M.R., Howieson, J., Siddik, M.A.B., Foysal, M.J., Fotedar, R., 2021. Supplementation of tuna hydrolysate and insect larvae improves fishmeal replacement efficacy of poultry by-product in Lates calcarifer (Bloch, 1790) juveniles. Sci. Rep. 11 (1), 4997. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-84660-5>.
- Chandra Segaran, T., Azra, M.N., Piah, R.M., Lananan, F., Téllez-Isaías, G., Gao, H., Torsabo, D., Kari, Z.A., Noordin, N.M., 2023. Catfishes: a global review of the literature. Heliyon 9 (9), e20081. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e20081.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e20081)
- Chen, Y., Sagada, G., Xu, B., Chao, W., Zou, F., Ng, W.-K., Sun, Y., Wang, L., Zhong, Z., Shao, Q., 2020. Partial replacement of fishmeal with Clostridium autoethanogenum single-cell protein in the diet for juvenile black sea bream (Acanthopagrus schlegelii). Aquac. Res. 51 (3), 1000–1011. <https://doi.org/10.1111/are.14446>.
- Colla, L.M., Reinehr, C.O., Manfredini, P.G., Farina Cavanhi, V.A., Vieira Costa, J.A., 2023. Simultaneous production of proteases and antioxidant biopeptides by solidstate fermentation. Sustain. Food Technol. 1 (6), 874–885. [https://doi.org/10.1039/](https://doi.org/10.1039/D3FB00077J) [D3FB00077J.](https://doi.org/10.1039/D3FB00077J)
- Council, N.R., 2011. Nutrient Requirements of Fish and Shrimp. The National Academies Press. <https://doi.org/10.17226/13039>.
- de la Cruz, C.P.P., Alap, L.P.B., Manalili, E.V., Rafael, R.R., [Tolentino,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref17) P.D.H., 2023. Prebiotic potential of Azolla pinnata (R. Br.) and dietary [inclusion](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref17) effect of pulverised azolla on the growth [performance](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref17) of milkfish fingerlings. J. Fish. 11 (1), [111201-111201.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref17)
- Das, M., Rahim, F.I., Hossain, M.A., 2018. Evaluation of Fresh Azolla pinnata as a Low-Cost Supplemental Feed for Thai Silver Barb Barbonymus gonionotus. Fishes 3 (1), 15. 〈<https://www.mdpi.com/2410-3888/3/1/15>〉.
- Davies, S.J., El-Haroun, E.R., Hassaan, M.S., Bowyer, P.H., 2021. A Solid-State Fermentation (SSF) supplement improved performance, digestive function and gut ultrastructure of rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss) fed plant protein diets containing yellow lupin meal. Aquaculture 545, 737177. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737177) [aquaculture.2021.737177.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737177)
- Dawood, M.A.O., Kari, Z.A., 2024. Editorial special issue: friendly nutritional strategies for sustainable aquaculture. Aquac. Fish. 9 (1), 1–2. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aaf.2023.01.003) [aaf.2023.01.003.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aaf.2023.01.003)
- Dawood, M.A.O., Koshio, S., 2020. Application of fermentation strategy in aquafeed for sustainable aquaculture. Rev. Aquac. 12 (2), 987–1002. [https://doi.org/10.1111/](https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12368) [raq.12368.](https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12368)
- Dawood, M.A.O., Moustafa, E.M., Gewaily, M.S., Abdo, S.E., AbdEl-kader, M.F., SaadAllah, M.S., Hamouda, A.H., 2020. Ameliorative effects of Lactobacillus plantarum L-137 on Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) exposed to deltamethrin toxicity in rearing water. Aquat. Toxicol. 219, 105377 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquatox.2019.105377) [aquatox.2019.105377.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquatox.2019.105377)
- De Oliveira, N.S., Ha, N., Da Cunha, L., Cipriani, L.A., Neto, A.T., Skoronski, E., Gisbert, E., Perez Fabregat, T.E.H., 2022. Fermentation of Soybean Meal with Lactobacillus acidophilus Allows Greater Inclusion of Vegetable Protein in the Diet and Can Reduce Vibrionacea in the Intestine of the South American Catfish

#### <span id="page-9-0"></span>*T.J.T. Shimul et al.*

(Rhamdia quelen). Animals 12 (6), 690. 〈[https://www.mdpi.com/2076-2615/12](https://www.mdpi.com/2076-2615/12/6/690) [/6/690](https://www.mdpi.com/2076-2615/12/6/690)〉.

Dienye, H., Olumuji, O., 2014. Growth performance and [haematological](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref24) responses of African mud catfish Clarias [gariepinus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref24) fed dietary levels of Moringa oleifera leaf meal. Net J. [Agric.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref24) Sci. 2 (2), 79–88.

Dorothy, M., Raman, S., Nautiyal, V., Singh, K., [Yogananda,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref25) T., Kamei, M., 2018. Use of potential plant leaves as ingredient in fish feed-a review. Int. J. Curr. [Microbiol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref25) [Appl.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref25) Sci. 7 (7), 112–125.

Elesho, F.E., Kröckel, S., Ciavoni, E., Sutter, D.A.H., Verreth, J.A.J., Schrama, J.W., 2021. Effect of feeding frequency on performance, nutrient digestibility, energy and nitrogen balances in juvenile African catfish (Clarias gariepinus) fed diets with two levels of crystalline methionine. Anim. Feed Sci. Technol. 281, 115098 [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2021.115098) [org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2021.115098.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2021.115098)

Esmaeili, N., 2021. Blood performance: a new formula for fish growth and health. Biology 10 (12), 1236. \https://www.mdpi.com/2079-7737/10/12/123

FAO. (2020). The State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture 2020. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.4060/ ca9229en.

Farhad, F.B., Hashem, S., Rana, K.M.S., Salam, M.A., 2023. Growth performance and hematological responses of silver barb (Barbonymus gonionotus bleeker, 1850) fingerlings to dietary blanched moringa (Moringa oleifera lam.) leaf meal as a substitute of soybean meal. Heliyon 9 (2), e13552. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13552) [heliyon.2023.e13552.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13552)

Fazio, F., 2019. Fish hematology analysis as an important tool of aquaculture: a review. Aquaculture 500, 237–242. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2018.10.030>.

Ferdous, Z., Hossain, M.K., Hadiuzzaman, M., Rafiquzzaman, S.M., Halim, K.M.A., Rahman, T., Faruk, M.A.R., Kari, Z.A., Shahjahan, M., 2023. Multi-species probiotics enhance survival, growth, intestinal microbiota and disease resistance of rohu (Labeo rohita) larvae. Water Biol. Secur., 100234 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watbs.2023.100234) [watbs.2023.100234.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watbs.2023.100234)

- Filannino, P., Di Cagno, R., Gobbetti, M., 2018. Metabolic and functional paths of lactic acid bacteria in plant foods: get out of the labyrinth. Curr. Opin. Biotechnol. 49, 64–72. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2017.07.016>.
- Flefil, N.S., Ezzat, A., Aboseif, A.M., Negm El-Dein, A., 2022. Lactobacillus-fermented wheat bran, as an economic fish feed ingredient, enhanced dephytinization, micronutrients bioavailability, and tilapia performance in a biofloc system. Biocatal. Agric. Biotechnol. 45, 102521 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bcab.2022.102521.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bcab.2022.102521)

Francis, G., Makkar, H.P.S., Becker, K., 2001. Antinutritional factors present in plantderived alternate fish feed ingredients and their effects in fish. Aquaculture 199 (3), 197–227. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486\(01\)00526-9.](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(01)00526-9)

Gatlin III, D.M., Barrows, F.T., Brown, P., Dabrowski, K., Gaylord, T.G., Hardy, R.W., Herman, E., Hu, G., Krogdahl, Å., Nelson, R., Overturf, K., Rust, M., Sealey, W., Skonberg, D., J Souza, E., Stone, D., Wilson, R., Wurtele, E., 2007. Expanding the utilization of sustainable plant products in aquafeeds: a review. Aquac. Res. 38 (6), 551–579. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2109.2007.01704.x>.

Han, Y.-K., Xu, Y.-C., Luo, Z., Zhao, T., Zheng, H., Tan, X.-Y., 2022. Fish meal replacement by mixed plant protein in the diets for Juvenile Yellow Catfish Pelteobagrus fulvidraco: effects on growth performance and health status. Aquac. Nutr. 2022, 2677885 <https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/2677885>.

Hayati, R.L., Hakim, L., Nurjannah, Prihanto, A.A., 2023. [Improvement](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref36) of duckweed (Azolla [microphylla\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref36) nutrition by Leuconostoc sp. isolated from Nile tilapia [\(Oreochromis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref36) niloticus). AACL Bioflux 16 (2), 1127–1135.

Haygood, A.M., Jha, R., 2018. Strategies to modulate the intestinal microbiota of Tilapia (Oreochromis sp.) in aquaculture: a review. Rev. Aquac. 10 (2), 320–333. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12162) [doi.org/10.1111/raq.12162](https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12162).

Hossain, M.K., Hossain, M.M., Mim, Z.T., Khatun, H., Hossain, M.T., Shahjahan, M., 2022. Multi-species probiotics improve growth, intestinal microbiota and morphology of Indian major carp mrigal Cirrhinus cirrhosus. Saudi J. Biol. Sci. 29 (9), 103399 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sjbs.2022.103399.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sjbs.2022.103399)

Hossain, M.K., Shahjahan, M., Kari, Z.A., Téllez-Isaías, G., 2023. Trends in the use of probiotics in aquaculture of Bangladesh—present state, problems, and prospects. Aquac. Res. 2023, 5566980 [https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/5566980.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/5566980)

Huang, H., Li, X., Cao, K., Leng, X., 2023. Effects of Replacing Fishmeal with the Mixture of Cottonseed Protein Concentrate and Clostridium autoethanogenum Protein on the Growth, Nutrient Utilization, Serum Biochemical Indices, Intestinal and Hepatopancreas Histology of Rainbow Trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss). Animals 13 (5), 817. 〈<https://www.mdpi.com/2076-2615/13/5/817>〉.

Irabor, A.E., [Obakanurhie,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref41) O., Nwachi, F.O., Ekokotu, P.A., Ekelemu, J.K., Awhefeada, O. K., Adeleke, L.M., Pierre Jrn, H., Adagha, O., 2022. [Duckweed](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref41) (Lemna minor) meal as partial [replacement](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref41) for fish meal in catfish (Clarias gariepinus) juvenile diets. [Livest.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref41) Res. Rural Dev. 34 (1), 1–6.

Ismail, T., Hegazi, E., Nassef, E., Habotta, O.A., Gewaily, M.S., 2022. The optimized inclusion level of Bacillus subtilis fermented Azolla pinnata in Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) diets: immunity, antioxidative status, intestinal digestive enzymes and histomorphometry, and disease resistance. Fish. Physiol. Biochem. 48 (3), 767–783. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10695-022-01076-2>.

Jiang, W., Jia, X., Xie, N., Wen, C., Ma, S., Jiang, G., Li, X., Chi, C., Zhang, D., Liu, W., 2023. Aquafeed fermentation improves dietary nutritional quality and benefits feeding behavior, meat flavor, and intestinal microbiota of Chinese mitten crab (Eriocheir sinensis). Anim. Nutr. 14, 1–19. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aninu.2023.04.002) [aninu.2023.04.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aninu.2023.04.002).

Kabir, M.A., Nandi, S.K., Suma, A.Y., Abdul Kari, Z., Mohamad Sukri, S.A., Wei, L.S., Al Mamun, A., Seguin, P., Herault, M., Khoo, M.I., Téllez-Isaías, G., 2024. The potential of fish protein hydrolysate supplementation in Nile Tilapia Diets: effects on growth and health performance, disease resistance, and farm economic analysis. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s12010-024-04913-7.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12010-024-04913-7)

- Kabir, K.A., Verdegem, M.C.J., Verreth, J.A.J., Phillips, M.J., Schrama, J.W., 2019. Effect of dietary protein to energy ratio, stocking density and feeding level on performance of Nile tilapia in pond aquaculture. Aquaculture 511, 634200. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.06.014) [10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.06.014.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.06.014)
- [Kapka-Skrzypczak,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref46) L., Niedźwiecka, J., Wojtyła, A., Kruszewski, M., 2012. Probiotics and prebiotics as a bioactive component of functional food. Pediatr. [Endocrinol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref46) <sub>.</sub><br>[Diabetes,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref46) Metab. 18 (2), 79–83.
- Kari, Z.A., Kabir, M.A., Dawood, M.A.O., Razab, M.K.A.A., Ariff, N.S.N.A., Sarkar, T., Pati, S., Edinur, H.A., Mat, K., Ismail, T.A., Wei, L.S., 2022. Effect of fish meal substitution with fermented soy pulp on growth performance, digestive enzyme, amino acid profile, and immune-related gene expression of African catfish (Clarias gariepinus). Aquaculture 546, 737418. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737418) [aquaculture.2021.737418.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737418)

Kari, Z.A., Sukri, S.A.M., Rusli, N.D., Mat, K., Mahmud, M.B., Zakaria, N.N.A., Wee, W., Hamid, N.K.A., Kabir, M.A., Ariff, N.S.N.A., Abidin, S.Z., Zakaria, M.K., Goh, K.W., Khoo, M.I., Van Doan, H., Tahiluddin, A., Wei, L.S., 2023. Recent advances, challenges, opportunities, product development and sustainability of main agricultural wastes for the aquaculture feed industry – a review. Ann. Anim. Sci. 23 (1), 25–38. <https://doi.org/10.2478/aoas-2022-0082>.

Khalil, H., Mansour, A., Goda, A., [El-Hammady,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref49) A., Omar, E., 2018. Effect of polyunsaturated fatty acids fortification on growth [performance,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref49) survival, fatty acid composition and antioxidant balance of meagre, [Argyrosomus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref49) regius Larvae. J. [Aquacult.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref49) Res. Dev. 9 (3), 1000529.

Khalil, H.S., Momoh, T., Al-Kenawy, D., Yossa, R., BadrEldin, A.M., Roem, A., Schrama, J., Verdegem, M., 2022. Metabolic growth, plankton selectivity, haematobiochemical and intestinal morphometry of Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) fed a lysine-deficient diet in earthen ponds. Aquac. Rep. 24, 101122 [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2022.101122) [10.1016/j.aqrep.2022.101122](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2022.101122).

Kösesakal, T., Yıldız, M., 2019. Growth [performance](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref51) and biochemical profile of Azolla pinnata and Azolla caroliniana grown under [greenhouse](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref51) conditions. Arch. Biol. Sci. .<br>71 (3), 475–[482.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref51)

Lee, S.-M., Mohammadi Azarm, H., Chang, K.H., 2016. Effects of dietary inclusion of fermented soybean meal on growth, body composition, antioxidant enzyme activity and disease resistance of rockfish (Sebastes schlegeli). Aquaculture 459, 110–116. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2016.03.036>.

Li, S., Ding, G., Song, F., Sang, C., Wang, A., Chen, N., 2020. Comparison of dehulled, fermented and enzyme-treated soybean meal in diets for largemouth bass, Micropterus salmoides: effects on growth performance, feed utilization, immune response and intestinal morphology. Anim. Feed Sci. Technol. 267, 114548 [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2020.114548) [doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2020.114548](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2020.114548).

Li, C., Tian, Y., Wang, L., Zhang, B., Ma, Q., 2022. Effects of Replacing Fishmeal by Raw or Lactobacillus acidophilus-Fermented Soybean Meal on Growth, Intestinal Digestive and Immune-Related Enzyme Activities, Morphology, and Microbiota in Turbot (Scophthalmus maximus L.). Aquac. Nutr. 2022, 2643235 [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/2643235) [10.1155/2022/2643235.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/2643235)

Liu, Y., Lu, Q., Xi, L., Gong, Y., Su, J., Han, D., Zhang, Z., Liu, H., Jin, J., Yang, Y., Zhu, X., Xie, S., 2021. Effects of replacement of dietary fishmeal by cottonseed protein concentrate on growth performance, liver health, and intestinal histology of largemouth Bass (Micropterus salmoides). Front. Physiol. 12 [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.3389/fphys.2021.764987) [10.3389/fphys.2021.764987.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fphys.2021.764987)

Liu, C., Ma, N., Feng, Y., Zhou, M., Li, H., Zhang, X., Ma, X., 2023. From probiotics to postbiotics: concepts and applications. Anim. Res. One Health 1 (1), 92–114. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1002/aro2.7) [doi.org/10.1002/aro2.7](https://doi.org/10.1002/aro2.7).

Lozano, A.R., Borges, P., Robaina, L., Betancor, M., Hernández-Cruz, C.M., García, J.R., Caballero, M.J., Vergara, J.M., Izquierdo, M., 2017. Effect of different dietary vitamin E levels on growth, fish composition, fillet quality and liver histology of meagre (Argyrosomus regius). Aquaculture 468, 175–183. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2016.10.006) [j.aquaculture.2016.10.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2016.10.006).

Magouz, F.I., Dawood, M.A.O., Salem, M.F.I., Mohamed, A.A.I., 2020. The effects of fish feed supplemented with meal on the growth performance, digestive enzyme activity, and health condition of genetically-improved farmed Tilapia. Ann. Anim. Sci. 20 (3), 1029–1045. <https://doi.org/10.2478/aoas-2020-0016>.

Malik, M.A., Sardar, P., Munilkumar, S., Varghese, T., Kumar, S., Gupta, G., Chandan, G. M., Bhat, N.M., 2024. Comparative evaluation of raw and fermented Eichhornia crassipes leaf meal in the diet of Cyprinus carpio fingerlings: effects on growth performance, body composition and haemato-biochemical responses. Anim. Feed Sci. Technol. 310, 115947 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2024.115947.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2024.115947)

Mandal, S., Ghosh, K., 2019. Utilization of fermented pistia leaves in the diet of rohu, labeo rohita (hamilton): effects on growth, digestibility and whole body composition. Waste Biomass Valoriz. 10 (11), 3331–3342. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12649-018-0336-4) [s12649-018-0336-4.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12649-018-0336-4)

Matulić, D., Barišić, J., Aničić, I., Tomljanović, T., Safner, R., Treer, T., Gao, J. Glojnarić, I., Čož-Rakovac, R., 2020. Growth, health aspects and histopathology of brown bullhead (Ameiurus nebulosus L.): replacing fishmeal with soybean meal and brewer's yeast. Sci. Rep. 10 (1), 1104. [https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-57722-](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-57722-3) [3](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-57722-3).

Mugwanya, M., Dawood, M.A.O., Kimera, F., Sewilam, H., 2023. Replacement of fish meal with fermented plant proteins in the aquafeed industry: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Rev. Aquac. 15 (1), 62–88. <https://doi.org/10.1111/raq.12701>.

Muhammad Anamul, K., Shishir Kumar, N., Afrina Yeasmin, S., Nik Shahman Nik Ahmad, A., 2023. Aquatic weeds as functional ingredients for aquaculture feed industry: recent advances, challenges, opportunities, new product development (NPD) and sustainability. Agric. Rep. 2 (2), 1–16. 〈[https://www.multiscipub.com/in](https://www.multiscipub.com/index.php/AgricultureReports/article/view/56) dex.php/AgricultureReports/article

Mzengereza, K., Ishikawa, M., Koshio, S., Shadrack, R.S., Zhang, Y., Dossou, S., Kotani, T., Shahin, S.A., Zaineldin, A.I., Waqalevu, V., Dawood, M.A.O., Hassan, A. <span id="page-10-0"></span>M., Al-Sharif, M.M., El Basuini, M.F., 2022. Responses of growth, blood health, proinflammatory cytokines genes, intestine and liver histology in Red Seabream (Pagrus major) to camelina meal. Aquac. Rep. 24, 101175 [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2022.101175) arep.2022.101175

- Nandi, S.K., Al Mamun, M.A., Suma, A.Y., Abdul Kari, Z., Wei, L.S., Tahiluddin, A.B., Manjappa, N.K., Nasren, S., Saha, S., Téllez-Isaías, G., Bottje, W.G., Kabir, M.A., 2024. Comparative analysis of biometrical and reproductive indices, proximate composition, and hemato-biochemical variables of cuchia eel Monopterus cuchia (Hamilton, 1822) from six different localities of Bangladesh. Heliyon 10 (3), e25491. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e25491>.
- Nandi, S.K., Suma, A.Y., Rashid, A., Kabir, M.A., Goh, K.W., Abdul Kari, Z., Van Doan, H., Zakaria, N.N.A., Khoo, M.I., Seong Wei, L., 2023. The potential of fermented water spinach meal as a fish meal replacement and the impacts on growth performance, reproduction, blood biochemistry and gut morphology of female stinging catfish (Heteropneustes fossilis). Life 13 (1), 176. 〈[https://www.mdpi.com/2075-1729/1](https://www.mdpi.com/2075-1729/13/1/176)  $3/1/176$
- Nasruddin, N.S., Azmai, M.N.A., Ismail, A., Saad, M.Z., Daud, H.M., Zulkifli, S.Z., 2014. Histological Features of the Gastrointestinal Tract of Wild Indonesian Shortfin Eel, Anguilla bicolor bicolor (McClelland, 1844), Captured in Peninsular Malaysia. Sci. World J. 2014, 312670 [https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/312670.](https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/312670)
- Nisha, S.N., Geetha, B., 2017. Effect of partial [replacement](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref68) of fishmeal with aquatic weed Pistia stratiotes meal on growth, biochemical composition, [haematological](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref68) [parameters](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref68) and digestive enzymes in Indian major carp Labeo rohita (Hamilton, 1822). Int. J. Fish. [Aquat.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref68) Stud. 5 (2), 527–532.
- de Oliveira, C.F., Corrêa, A.P.F., Coletto, D., Daroit, D.J., Cladera-Olivera, F., Brandelli, A., 2015. Soy protein hydrolysis with microbial protease to improve antioxidant and functional properties. J. Food Sci. Technol. 52 (5), 2668–2678. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-014-1317-7.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-014-1317-7)
- Palaniyappan, S., Sridhar, A., Kari, Z.A., Téllez-Isaías, G., Ramasamy, T., 2023. Potentials of Aloe barbadensis inclusion in fish feeds on resilience to Aeromonas hydrophila infection in freshwater fish Labeo rohita. Fish. Physiol. Biochem. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10695-023-01266-6) [10.1007/s10695-023-01266-6.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10695-023-01266-6)
- Pirarat, N., Pinpimai, K., Endo, M., Katagiri, T., Ponpornpisit, A., Chansue, N., Maita, M., 2011. Modulation of intestinal morphology and immunity in nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) by Lactobacillus rhamnosus GG. Res Vet. Sci. 91 (3), e92–e97. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rvsc.2011.02.014.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rvsc.2011.02.014)
- Rahman, M., Mamun, M.A.A., Rathore, S.S., Nandi, S.K., Abdul Kari, Z., Wei, L.S., Tahiluddin, A.B., Rahman, M.M., Manjappa, N.K., Hossain, A., Nasren, S., Alam, M. M.M., Bottie, W.G., Téllez-Isaías, G., Kabir, M.A., 2023. Effects of dietary supplementation of natural Spirulina on growth performance, hemato-biochemical indices, gut health, and disease resistance to Aeromonas hydrophila of Stinging catfish (Heteropneustes fossilis) fingerling. Aquac. Rep. 32, 101727 [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2023.101727) [10.1016/j.aqrep.2023.101727](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2023.101727).
- Rajaram, V., Jannathulla, R., Rajendran, R., Ambasankar, K., Panigrahi, A., Dayal, J.S., 2022. Bacillus spp. fermented plant protein mix as a potential fishmeal substitute in the diet of Penaeus monodon: emphasis on nitrogen metabolism. Aquac. Nutr. 2022, 1629813 <https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/1629813>.
- Rebl, A., Goldammer, T., 2018. Under control: the innate immunity of fish from the inhibitors' perspective. Fish. Shellfish Immunol. 77, 328–349. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2018.04.016) [10.1016/j.fsi.2018.04.016.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2018.04.016)
- Refaey, M.M., Mehrim, A.I., Zenhom, O.A., Areda, H.A., Ragaza, J.A., Hassaan, M.S., 2023. Fresh Azolla, Azolla pinnata as a complementary feed for oreochromis niloticus: growth, digestive enzymes, intestinal morphology, physiological responses, and flesh quality. Aquac. Nutr. 2023, 1403704 [https://doi.org/10.1155/](https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/1403704) [2023/1403704](https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/1403704).
- Ringø, E., Hoseinifar, S.H., Ghosh, K., Doan, H.V., Beck, B.R., Song, S.K., 2018. Lactic acid bacteria in finfish—an update [Review]. Front. Microbiol. 9 [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.01818) [10.3389/fmicb.2018.01818.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.01818)
- Sadia, A., Talukdar Jannat Tamanna, S., Nahid Hasan, S., Shishir Kumar, N., Afrina Yeasmin, S., Md. Tariqul, A., Muhammad Anamul, K., 2023. Attractability and palatability of formulated diets incorporated with fermented aquatic weeds meal (FAWM) for Asian catfish Clarias batrachus fingerling. Agric. Rep. 2 (2), 25–40.  $www.multiscipub.com/index.php/AgricultureRepository/article/view/58\rangle.$
- Seal, B.S., Drider, D., Oakley, B.B., Brüssow, H., Bikard, D., Rich, J.O., Miller, S., Devillard, E., Kwan, J., Bertin, G., Reeves, S., Swift, S.M., Raicek, M., Gay, C.G., 2018. Microbial-derived products as potential new antimicrobials. Vet. Res. 49 (1), 66. [https://doi.org/10.1186/s13567-018-0563-5.](https://doi.org/10.1186/s13567-018-0563-5)
- Seong, M., Lee, S., Lee, S., Song, Y., Bae, J., Chang, K., Bai, S.C., 2018. The effects of different levels of dietary fermented plant-based protein concentrate on growth, hematology and non-specific immune responses in juvenile olive flounder, Paralichthys olivaceus. Aquaculture 483, 196-202. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2017.10.023) aculture.2017.10.023.
- Sezu, N.H., Nandi, S.K., Suma, A.Y., Kari, Z.A., Wei, L.S., Seguin, P., Herault, M., Hossain, M.S., Khoo, M.I., Eissa, E.-S.H., Kabir, M.A., 2024. Ameliorative effects of different dietary levels of fish protein hydrolysate (FPH) on GRowth and Reproductive Performance, Feed Stability, Tissues Biochemical Composition, Haematobiochemical Profile, Liver Histology, and Economic Analysis of Pabda (Ompok Pabda) Broodstock. Aquac. Res. 2024, 6044920 [https://doi.org/10.1155/](https://doi.org/10.1155/2024/6044920) [2024/6044920](https://doi.org/10.1155/2024/6044920).
- Sitjà-Bobadilla, A., Peña-Llopis, S., Gómez-Requeni, P., Médale, F., Kaushik, S., Pérez-Sánchez, J., 2005. Effect of fish meal replacement by plant protein sources on nonspecific defence mechanisms and oxidative stress in gilthead sea bream (Sparus

aurata). Aquaculture 249 (1), 387–400. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2005.03.031) [aquaculture.2005.03.031.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2005.03.031)

- Srivastava, N., Srivastava, M., Ramteke, P.W., Mishra, P.K., 2019. Chapter 23 Solidstate fermentation strategy for microbial metabolites production: an overview. In: Gupta, V.K., Pandey, A. (Eds.), New and Future Developments in Microbial Biotechnology and Bioengineering. Elsevier, pp. 345–354. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-63504-4.00023-2) 504-4.000
- Suma, A.Y., Nandi, S.K., Abdul Kari, Z., Goh, K.W., Wei, L.S., Tahiluddin, A.B., Seguin, P., Herault, M., Al Mamun, A., Téllez-Isaías, G., Anamul Kabir, M., 2023. Beneficial effects of graded levels of fish protein hydrolysate (FPH) on the growth performance, blood biochemistry, liver and intestinal health, economics efficiency, and disease resistance to aeromonas hydrophila of pabda (Ompok pabda) Fingerling. Fishes 8 (3), 147. 〈<https://www.mdpi.com/2410-3888/8/3/147>〉.
- Taverniti, V., Guglielmetti, S., 2011. The immunomodulatory properties of probiotic microorganisms beyond their viability (ghost probiotics: proposal of paraprobiotic concept). Genes Nutr. 6 (3), 261–274. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s12263-011-0218-x.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12263-011-0218-x) Tewari, G., Kaur, R., 2022. Fish feed supplementation using [nonconventional](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref85) plant
- resources: Way to sustainable [aquaculture.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref85) Pharma Innov. J. 11 (5), 309–321. Thorat, M., 2017. [Biochemical](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref86) contents of nutritional values of Clarias batrachus. Int. J. Life Sci. 5 (3), [481](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref86)–482.
- Torstensen, B.E., Espe, M., Sanden, M., Stubhaug, I., Waagbø, R., Hemre, G.I., Fontanillas, R., Nordgarden, U., Hevrøy, E.M., Olsvik, P., Berntssen, M.H.G., 2008. Novel production of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) protein based on combined replacement of fish meal and fish oil with plant meal and vegetable oil blends. Aquaculture 285 (1), 193–200. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2008.08.025.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2008.08.025)
- Veisi, R.S., Taghdir, M., Abbaszadeh, S., Hedayati, A., 2023. Dietary Effects of Probiotic Lactobacillus casei on Some Immunity Indices of Common Carp (Cyprinus carpio) Exposed to Cadmium. Biol. Trace Elem. Res. 201 (2), 959–967. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12011-022-03205-7) [10.1007/s12011-022-03205-7.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12011-022-03205-7)
- Velásquez, Y.C., Kijora, C., Wuertz, S., Schulz, C., 2015. Effect of [fermented](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref89) aquatic macrophytes [supplementation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref89) on growth performance, feed efficiency and digestibility of Nile Tilapia [\(Oreochromis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref89) niloticus) juveniles fed low fishmeal diets. [Livest.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref89) Res. Rural Dev. 27 (9), 177.
- Verma, V.K., Rani, K.V., Kumar, S.R., Prakash, O., 2018. Leucaena leucocephala pod seed protein as an alternate to animal protein in fish feed and evaluation of its role to fight against infection caused by Vibrio harveyi and Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Fish. Shellfish Immunol. 76, 324–332. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2018.03.011.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2018.03.011)
- Vo, B.V., Siddik, M.A.B., Chaklader, M.R., Fotedar, R., Nahar, A., Foysal, M.J., Bui, D.P., Nguyen, H.Q., 2020. Growth and health of juvenile barramundi (Lates calcarifer) challenged with DO hypoxia after feeding various inclusions of germinated, fermented and untreated peanut meals. PLoS One 15 (4), e0232278. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0232278) [10.1371/journal.pone.0232278.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0232278)
- Wang, Y.Z., Sun, J.F., Lv, A.J., Zhang, S.L., Sung, Y.Y., Shi, H.Y., Hu, X.C., Chen, S.J., Xing, K.Z., 2018. Histochemical distribution of four types of enzymes and mucous cells in the gastrointestinal tract of reared half-smooth tongue sole Cynoglossus semilaevis. J. Fish. Biol. 92 (1), 3–16. [https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.13469.](https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.13469)
- Welker, T., Barrows, F., Overturf, K., Gaylord, G., Sealey, W., 2016. Optimizing zinc supplementation levels of rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss) fed practical type fishmeal- and plant-based diets. Aquac. Nutr. 22 (1), 91-108. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1111/anu.12232) [10.1111/anu.12232](https://doi.org/10.1111/anu.12232).
- Witeska, M., Kondera, E., Ługowska, K., Bojarski, B., 2022. Hematological methods in fish – Not only for beginners. Aquaculture 547, 737498. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737498) [aquaculture.2021.737498.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737498)
- Yousif, R.A., [Abdullah,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref95) O.J., Ahmed, A.M., Adam, M.I., Ahmed, F.A.M., Idam, O.A., 2019. Effect of replacing fishmeal with water spinach [\(Ipomoea](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref95) aquatica) on growth, feed conversion and carcass composition for Nile tilapia fry [\(Oreochromis](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref95) niloticus). J. [Aquat.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref95) Sci. Mar. Biol. 2, 13–20.
- Yu, H.-B., Gao, Q.-F., Dong, S.-L., Wen, B., 2015. Changes in fatty acid profiles of sea cucumber Apostichopus japonicus (Selenka) induced by terrestrial plants in diets. Aquaculture 442, 119–124. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2015.03.002>.
- Zakaria, M.K., Kari, Z.A., Van Doan, H., Kabir, M.A., Che Harun, H., Mohamad Sukri, S. A., Goh, K.W., Wee, W., Khoo, M.I., Wei, L.S., 2022. Fermented Soybean Meal (FSBM) in African Catfish (Clarias gariepinus) Diets: Effects on Growth Performance, Fish Gut Microbiota Analysis, Blood Haematology, and Liver Morphology. Life 12 (11), 1851. 〈<https://www.mdpi.com/2075-1729/12/11/1851>〉.
- Zhang, C., Rahimnejad, S., Wang, Y.-r, Lu, K., Song, K., Wang, L., Mai, K., 2018. Substituting fish meal with soybean meal in diets for Japanese seabass (Lateolabrax japonicus): effects on growth, digestive enzymes activity, gut histology, and expression of gut inflammatory and transporter genes. Aquaculture 483, 173–182.  $\frac{1}{\sqrt{60i} \cdot \text{org}/10.1016}{i}$ .aquaculture.2017.10.029.
- Zhao, W., Liu, Z.-L., Niu, J., 2021. Growth performance, intestinal histomorphology, body composition, hematological and antioxidant parameters of Oncorhynchus mykiss were not detrimentally affected by replacement of fish meal with concentrated dephenolization cottonseed protein. Aquac. Rep. 19, 100557 [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2020.100557) [doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2020.100557](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aqrep.2020.100557).
- Zhou, F., Song, W., Shao, Q., Peng, X., Xiao, J., Hua, Y., Owari, B.N., Zhang, T., Ng, W.- K., 2011. Partial replacement of fish meal by fermented soybean meal in diets for Black Sea Bream, Acanthopagrus schlegelii, Juveniles. J. World Aquac. Soc. 42 (2), 184–197. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-7345.2011.00455.x>.
- [Zulhisyam,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref101) A.K., Kabir, M.A., Munir, M.B., Wei, L.S., 2020. Using of fermented soy pulp as an edible coating material on fish feed pellet in African catfish (Clarias [gariepinus\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref101) [production.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-5134(24)00393-4/sbref101) Aquac. Aquar. Conserv. Legis. 13 (1), 296–308.